Advanced Testing of Safe-Solvent Replacements for CFC-113 For Use in Cleaning Oxygen Systems

Lawrence R. Grzyll, John A. Meyer, and Dwight D. Back Mainstream Engineering Corporation Rockledge, Florida 32955



a. REPORT unclassified	b. ABSTRACT unclassified	c. THIS PAGE unclassified	OF ABSTRACT	OF PAGES 23	RESPONSIBLE PERSON
			17. LIMITATION	18. NUMBER	19a. NAME OF
15. SUBJECT TERMS					
14. ABSTRACT N/A					
13. SUPPLEMENTARY N	OTES				
12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAI Approved for pub	iLABILITY STATEMENT lic release; distribut	tion unlimited			
			11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT NUMBER(S)		
9. SPONSORING/MONITO	ORING AGENCY NAME(S)	AND ADDRESS(ES)		10. SPONSOR/M	ONITOR'S ACRONYM(S)
	IIZATION NAME(S) AND A neering Corporation kledge,FL,32955	` '	Center,200	5f. WORK UNIT 8. PERFORMING NUMBER	G ORGANIZATION REPORT
				-	NHMDED
				5e. TASK NUME 01PF	BER
6. AUTHOR(S) Lawrence Grzyll;	John Meyer; Dwigh	nt Back		5d. PROJECT NU 3005	UMBER
			5c. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER		
Cleaning Oxygen	Systems			5b. GRANT NUM	ИВER
4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE Advanced Testing	of Safe-Solvent Rep	placements for CFC	C-113 for Use in	5a. CONTRACT F04611-01-	
1. REPORT DATE JUN 2005		2. REPORT TYPE		3. DATES COVE	ERED
including suggestions for reducin	completing and reviewing the collecting this burden, to Washington Headquild be aware that notwithstanding a OMB control number.	uarters Services, Directorate for In	formation Operations and Repo	rts, 1215 Jefferson Dav	is Highway, Suite 1204, Arlington

Public reporting burden for the collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instructions, searching existing data sources, gathering and

Report Documentation Page

Form Approved OMB No. 0704-0188

Background

- Use and Production of CFC-113 Restricted
- Replacement Cleaning Solvent Needed
 - Solvency As Good or Better Than CFC-113
 - Non-Flammable
 - Compatible With Liquid and Gaseous Oxygen
 - Low Toxicity or Non-Toxic
 - Acceptable Environmental Properties
 - Similar Volatility and Other Physical Properties
 - Manufacturable at Reasonable Cost



Phase I Compound Screening

- Screened 247 Untested Halogenated Compounds
 - Solubility Parameter Solvency Screening Property
 - Predicted Using Structure-Property Relationships (SPRs)
 - Compounds With Similar Solubility Parameters Have Similar Solvency
 - Other SPRs Used to Predict Atmospheric Properties, Toxicity, Boiling Point
- 5 Pure Compounds and 3 Mixtures Recommended
 - Solvency and Materials Compatibility Tests Performed



Solvent Candidates

Solvent Candidates

- 4-bromo-3-chloro-3,4,4-trifluoro-1-butene, CH₂=CH-CFCI-CF₂Br
- 1-chloro-2,2,2-trifluoroethyl difluoromethyl ether, CHF₂-O-CHCl-CF₃
- 2-chloro-1,1,2-trifluoroethyl difluoromethyl ether, CHF₂-O-CF₂-CHFCl
- methyl 2,2,2-trifluoroethyl-1-trifluoromethyl ether, CH₃-O-CH-(CF₃)₂
- 1-bromo-2-(trifluoromethyl)-3,3,3-trifluoropropene, CHBr=C-(CF₃)₂
- mixtures of CH₂=CH-CFCI-CF₂Br and CHF₂-O-CHCI-CF₃

Baseline Solvents For Comparison

- 1-iodononafluorobutane, CF₂I-CF₂-CF₂-CF₃ (Ikon P)
- 1,3-dichloro-1,1,2,2,3-pentafluoropropane, CF₂CI-CF₂-CHFCI (AK-225G)
- CFC-113, CFCl₂-CF₂Cl

Objectives

- Perform Solvency Tests Against Selected Contaminants
- Determine Compatibility With Liquid and Gaseous Oxygen
- Measure Flammability
- Determine Atmospheric Impact
- Determine Toxicity Characteristics
- Measure Key Thermophysical Properties
- Recommend Replacement Solvent
- Determine Cleaning Effectiveness in an Oxidizer System
- Assess Manufacturability of Recommended Solvent

(MAINSTREAM

Solvency Tests

- Apply Approximately 0.1 grams of Contaminant on 1" Square Stainless Coupon
- Clean Static and Using Ultrasonics in 15 ml. of Solvent
- Mass of Contaminant
 Removed Determined By
 Weight Difference of Coupon
 Before and After Cleaning
- Most Solvent Candidates
 Cleaned As Good or Better
 Than CFC-113

• Selected Contaminants:

- Mil-Spec 83232 Hydraulic Oil
- Mil-Spec 7808 Engine Oil
- Mil-Spec 81322Hydrocarbon Grease
- Krytox
- Simple Green Aqueous Cleaner



Compatibility With Gaseous Oxygen

- ASTM G72, "Standard Test Method for Autogenous Ignition Temperature of Liquids and Solids in a High-Pressure Oxygen Enriched Environment"
 - AIT < 250°F, Not Recommended for O₂ Systems
 - AIT 250°F 400°F, Use Caution in O₂ Systems
 - AIT > 400°F, Recommended for O₂ Systems
- Performed by Wendell Hull & Associates



GO₂ Compatibility Results

Solvent	Average AIT	Category
methyl 2,2,2-trifluoroethyl-1-trifluoromethyl ether	451°F	Recommended
1-bromo-2-(trifluoromethyl)-3,3,3-trifluoropropene	725°F	Recommended
4-bromo-3-chloro-3,4,4-trifluoro-1-butene	378°F	Caution
1-chloro-2,2,2-trifluoroethyl difluoromethyl ether	390°F	Caution
2-chloro-1,1,2-trifluoroethyl difluoromethyl ether	464°F	Recommended
1,1,2-trichloro-1,2,2-trifluoroethane (CFC-113)	no ignition @	Recommended
	50 psia and 2000 psia	
1-iodononafluorobutane (Ikon P)	345-355°F @ 2000 psia	Caution
1,3-dichloro-1,1,2,2,3-pentafluoropropane (AK-225)	no ignition @	Recommended
	50 psia and 2000 psia	



Compatibility With Liquid Oxygen

- ASTM G86, "Standard Test Method for Determining Ignition Sensitivity of Materials to Mechanical Impact in Pressurized Oxygen Environments"
 - Pass if No Reactions in 20 Impacts
 - Pass if Not More Than One Reaction in 60 Impacts
- Performed By NASA-WSTF Personnel



LOX Compatibility Results

Solvent	Results	Category
methyl 2,2,2-trifluoroethyl-1-trifluoromethyl ether	1 Reaction/60 Impacts	Passed
1-bromo-2-(trifluoromethyl)-3,3,3-trifluoropropene	2 Reactions/28 Impacts	Failed
4-bromo-3-chloro-3,4,4-trifluoro-1-butene	2 Reactions/10 Impacts	Failed
1-chloro-2,2,2-trifluoroethyl difluoromethyl ether	0 Reactions/20 Impacts	Passed
2-chloro-1,1,2-trifluoroethyl difluoromethyl ether	0 Reactions/20 Impacts	Passed
25% 4-bromo-3-chloro-3,4,4-trifluoro-1-butene 75% 1-chloro-2,2,2-trifluoroethyl difluoromethyl ether	1 Reaction/60 Impacts	Passed
50% 4-bromo-3-chloro-3,4,4-trifluoro-1-butene 50% 1-chloro-2,2,2-trifluoroethyl difluoromethyl ether	0 Reactions/20 Impacts	Passed
1,1,2-trichloro-1,2,2-trifluoroethane (CFC-113)		Passed
1-iodononafluorobutane (Ikon P) (Taken From Reference 4)	2 Reactions/17 Impacts	Failed
1,3-dichloro-1,1,2,2,3-pentafluoropropane (AK-225)		Passed



Flammability Tests

- ASTM D93, "Standard Test Method for Flash Point by Pensky-Martens Closed Tester"
- Performed By Mainstream
- No Flash Points Observed For Candidate Solvents or Baseline Solvents



Atmospheric Impact

- Some Information Found In Open Literature
- Compounds With Unknown Information Tested By Dr. Vladimir Orkin of NIST
 - Measured Reactivity Toward Hydroxyl Radicals (Atmospheric Lifetime)
 - Measure UV Absorption Cross Section (ODP and GWP)



Atmospheric Properties

Compound	ODP	GWP	Atmospheric
			Lifetime
1-chloro-2,2,2-trifluoroethyl difluoromethyl ether	0.004-0.03	200	2-5.9 yrs.
2-chloro-1,1,2-trifluoroethyl difluoromethyl ether	0.004-0.04	330	2.4-8.2 yrs.
4-bromo-3-chloro-3,4,4-trifluoro-1-butene	0.00014-0.012	< 10	4.2 days
methyl 2,2,2-trifluoroethyl-1-trifluoromethyl ether	0	13 - 43	65 days
CFC-113	0.9	5000	85 yrs.
Ikon-P	< 0.0025	< 2	2 days
AK-225	0.02-0.03	170-530	6.6 yrs.



Toxicity Characteristics

- Ames Test For Mutagenicity
- Acute Skin Irritation (Rabbit)
- Acute Oral Toxicity (Rat)
- Tests Performed By ST&T Consultants
 - Performed per Good Laboratory Practice (GLP)



Toxicity Properties

Compound	LD50	Ames	Dermal Irritation Index
1-chloro-2,2,2-trifluoroethyl difluoromethyl ether	8.1 g/kg	negative	0.2
2-chloro-1,1,2-trifluoroethyl difluoromethyl ether	13.0 g/kg	negative	0.08
4-bromo-3-chloro-3,4,4-trifluoro- 1-butene	> 40 g/kg	negative	2.13
methyl 2,2,2-trifluoroethyl-1- trifluoromethyl ether	> 40 g/kg	negative	0.25
1-bromo-2-(trifluoromethyl)-3,3,3- trifluoropropene	0.1 g/kg	negative	1.33
CFC-113	43 g/kg	negative	mild irritant
Ikon-P	no data	negative	mild irritant
AK-225	> 5 g/kg	negative	no data

Dermal Irritation Index

3.0-4.9 = potential for severe irritation 2.0-2.9 = potential for moderate irritation

1.0-1.9 = potential for mild irritation

0.1-0.9 = potential for slight irritation

<0.1 = no irritation potential



Recommend Solvent Replacement

- Ranking Scheme Developed Based On Properties Studied
 - Cost Included in Ranking
- Mixture of 25% 4-bromo-3-chloro-3,4,4trifluoro-1-butene and 75% 1-chloro-2,2,2trifluoroethyl difluoromethyl ether Recommended



Key Physical Properties

- Measured At 25°C By Mainstream
 - Liquid Density
 - Liquid Viscosity
 - Surface Tension
 - Vapor Pressure
 - Boiling Range
 - Freezing Point



Key Physical Props. At 25°C

Property	Value
Liquid Density	1.53 g/ml
Liquid Viscosity	0.554 cP
Surface Tension	17.1 dyne/cm
Vapor Pressure	264 mm Hg
Boiling Range	55-96°C
Freezing Point	<-127°C

MAINS TREAM
Engineering Corporation

Cleaning An Oxidizer System

- Air Force Oxidizer System Sent to Mainstream
- Procedure Based on NASA WSTF Cleaning Studies
- Contaminants:
 - Krytox GPL 224
 - 83282 Hydraulic Oil
 - 7808 Hydraulic Grease
 - 81322 Hydrocarbon Grease
 - 2 Solutions Prepared: 0.95 and 1.6 grams of Each
 Contaminant Dissolved in CFC-113
 - 32 ml. of Solution Introduced to System

Photograph of System





Cleaning Results

Contaminant Solution	CFC-113 Results	Mainstream Solvent Blend	
		Results	
Dilute	80.3 % Removal	89.6 % Removal	
(0.95 grams each contaminant)			
Concentrated	90.6 % Removal	74.0 % Removal	
(1.56 grams each contaminant)			

MAINS TREAM
Engineering Corporation

Assess Manufacturability

- Patent Application Filed With USPTO
- Mainstream's Estimated Delivery Price:
 - \$185/gallon at 500 gallons per month
- Technology Spun-off Into HVAC&R Industry
 - Flushing Solvent
 - Leak Detector For Furnace Heat Exchangers
 - Sensitive Refrigerant Leak Detector



Conclusions

- Replacement Solvent For CFC-113 For Cleaning Oxygen Systems Identified
 - Superior to CFC-113 in Coupon Solvency Tests
 - Similar to CFC-113 in Cleaning Oxygen Systems
 - Acceptable Toxicity and Atmospheric Properties
 - Non-Flammable and Oxygen Compatible
 - Affordable Cost
 - Spin-off Commercial Applications in HVAC&R Industry